Case 1:07-cv-07434-LTS Document 13 Filed 11/28/2007 AUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LOVD K. GARRISON (1946-1991) SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1995) LOUIS S. WEISS (1927-1950) JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

212-373-3564

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

212-492-0564

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

sklein@paulweiss.com

1615 L STREET, NW WASHINGTON, DC 20036-5694 ELEPHONE (202) 223-7300 FACSIMILE (202) 223-7420

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING 2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101 FACSIMILE (81-3) 3597-8120

UNIT 3601, FORTUNE PLAZA OFFICE TOWER A NO. 7 DONG SANHUAN ZHONGLU CHAO YANG DISTRICT PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300 FACSIMILE (86-10) 6530-9070/9080

12TH FLOOR, HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING 3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL HONG KONG TELEPHONE (852) 2536-9933 FACSIMILE (852) 2536-9622

> ALDER CASTLE 10 NOBLE STREET LONDON EC2V 7JU, U.K. TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600 FACSIMILE (44 20) 7367 1650

ENBOIM PAER BOEHNING NVINO BONISOFF JAY COHENLAY COHENKELLEY A CORNISH
CHARLES E. DAVIDOW
DOUGLAS R. DAVIS
THOMAS V. DE LA BASTIDE III
ARIEL DECKELBAUM
ARIEL DECKELBAUM
ARIEL DECKELBAUM
MARC FALCONE
PETER L. FELCHE
PETER E. FISCHE
POSERT C. ELEDER PETER L. FELCHER
PETER E. FISCH
ROBERT C. FLEDER
MARTIN FLUMENBAUM
ANDREW J. FOLEY
HARRIS B. FREIDUS
KENNETH A. GALLOS
MICHAEL E. GERTZMAN
PAUL D. GINSBERG
ERIC S. GOLDSTEIN
ERIC S. GOLDSTEIN
ERIC S. GOLDSTEIN
ERIC S. GOLDSTEIN
CHARLES H. GOOGE. JR.
HARRIES JOHNSON
MEREDITH J. KANE
ROBERT M. HIRSH
MICHELE HIRSHMAN
JOYCE S. HUANG
JEH CHARLES JOHNSON
MEREDITH J. KANE
ROBERTA A. KAPLAN
BRAD S. KARP

SAMUELS RO HIMEK . SCHNEIDER SCHUMER :HWAB SHIMSHAK TII AR SIMKIN J. SIMONS DAL DERBERG AZQUEZ YE N. YOSHINO RED D. YOUNGWOOD ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI. JR

NOT ADMITTED TO NEW YORK BAR

November 21, 2007

## By Hand Delivery

Hon. Laura T. Swain Daniel Patrick Movnihan United States Courthouse 500 Pearl Street, Room 755 New York, NY 10007



Milstein v. Federal Bureau of Prisons, 07-Civ-7434 (LTS) (FM)

Dear Judge Swain:

We represent Plaintiffs in the above-referenced class action. The parties have agreed upon the enclosed Stipulation and [Proposed] Order of Dismissal Without Prejudice (the "Stipulation"). We respectfully request that the Court endorse the Stipulation and dismiss this action without prejudice. The parties are also available to appear before the Court to answer any questions regarding the Stipulation.

Although no class has been certified in this case, we believe it our obligation to inform the Court of the basis for the agreement to dismiss this action. See In re Austrian and German Bank Holocaust Litigation, 2001 WL 228107, \*3-4 (March 8, 2001 S.D.N.Y.) (finding that court approval is necessary for voluntary dismissals of precertification class actions to confirm that there was no collusion between the parties and that the dismissal does not prejudice the putative class members). See also F.R.C.P. 23(e) (parties seeking voluntary withdrawal of class action must file a statement identifying any agreements between the parties).

Hon, Laura T. Swain

First, as averred in the Stipulation, there are no formal or informal agreements between the parties other than the Stipulation itself.

Second, the litigation has largely succeeded in accomplishing its goals. As we set forth in the Class Action Complaint filed on August 21, 2007, Defendant Federal Bureau of Prisons ("BOP") had implemented the Standardized Chapel Library Project (the "SCLP"), which involved the removal of many religious materials that did not appear on a pre-approved list of religious resources. This resulted in the unavailability of certain library religious books and media that were relied upon by the inmates at BOP facilities.

After the filing of this class action, on September 26, 2007, the BOP announced that they will return the removed materials to the shelves and that the SCLP will not be implemented as planned. The BOP has provided us with documentation whereby the BOP Central Office directed all BOP institutions to return the books. The BOP also affirms in the Stipulation that it has received confirmation of compliance from the individual institutions. We also have received independent reports from the Otisville Prison Camp and other facilities that the removed religious materials were in fact returned to the shelves.<sup>1</sup>

We understand that the BOP is currently undergoing an inventory and screening of the materials in chapel libraries at BOP institutions, and, sometime in 2008, expects to remove *specific* materials that it finds inappropriate for circulation in its correctional institutions, but has no plans to reinstate the SCLP.

We will continue to monitor events as they unfold, and the dismissal is without prejudice in the event that the BOP reinstates the SCLP. For now, however, this action has achieved its main objectives – the return of religious materials to the chapel libraries and an end to the SCLP – and can be brought to a close.

We have been notified by a religious organization ministering the inmate population that the materials that were removed at two facilities may have been destroyed or discarded, and that these materials were not returned. We have not been able to independently verify that information because the religious organization has declined to disclose the identity of the two facilities. Further, the BOP Central Office has indicated that it is not aware of any destruction of materials.

In any case, these instances would be the exception and not suitable for class litigation. Most importantly, the dismissal of this action is without prejudice and would not extinguish any claims that inmates in those facilities may have.

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

Hon. Laura T. Swain

Accordingly, we request, with the consent of Defendants, that the Court endorse the enclosed joint Stipulation.

Respectfully submitted,

Solomon N. Klein

cc: Hon. Frank Maas

AUSA Brian Feldman